18-447: Computer Architecture
Guidelines on Paper Reviews

Prof. Onur Mutlu
Carnegie Mellon University
Spring 2015
How to Do the Paper/Talk Reviews

1: Brief summary
- What is the problem the paper is trying to solve?
- What are the key ideas of the paper? Key insights?
- What is the key contribution to literature at the time it was written?
- What are the most important things you take out from it?

2: Strengths (most important ones)
- Does the paper solve the problem well?

3: Weaknesses (most important ones)
- This is where you should think critically. Every paper/idea has a weakness. This does not mean the paper is necessarily bad. It means there is room for improvement and future research can accomplish this.

4: Can you do (much) better? Present your thoughts/ideas.

5: What have you learned/enjoyed/disliked in the paper? Why?

- Review should be short and concise (~half a page or shorter)
Advice on Paper/Talk Reviews

- When doing the reviews, be very critical
- Always think about better ways of solving the problem or related problems